Promotions Criteria

Mike McCune presented a revision of Medicine’s Promotions Criteria that he and Bob Nussbaum drafted. The revisions are in response to previous discussions by the Council regarding the need for the promotions criteria to promote collaborative research and to accurately reflect the criteria that are currently applied in evaluations for promotions. The intent is for a final revision to be presented to Talmadge for discussion at the Department’s Execution Promotions Committee (EPC). The Council agreed that creative research remains essential for promotion, but it concluded that the published criteria may discourage collaboration by emphasizing research done independently of colleagues. While this facilitates evaluation of independence, it may not recognize the importance of team research. To alter this emphasis, the revised criteria suggest revisions in several areas.

- Publications that include a mentor as an author should be considered, especially where the contributions of the candidate are independent and creative.
- Assessment of the contributions of authors to published work should go beyond acknowledging first and last authorship. The actual contribution to the work and the importance of that contribution should be assessed regardless of authorship position.
- Grant support from sources that fund collaborative research, including commercial sources, should be included in considering promotion.

These objectives remain grounded in the philosophy that creative scholarship should be the final arbiter of whether someone should be promoted or not. However, creative scholarship needs to be defined, and the draft leaves the determination to specific cases. It was noted that it may be helpful to include specific examples of methodological contributions or “niche” science to provide both candidates and reviewers a common view of the criteria and the review process.

It was noted that whatever changes are incorporated in the promotions criteria, instructions to referees will be needed to implement the new policy and principles.

Action Items

Mike McCune will draft another revision based upon our discussion to circulate for comments amongst the Council.
Future Meetings (location to be determined):

Monday, November 5, 2012
Tuesday, December 11, 2012
Monday, January 14, 2013
Tuesday, February 12, 2013
Monday, March 11, 2013
Tuesday, April 9, 2013
Monday, May 13, 2013
Tuesday, June 11, 2013